

## PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &amp; GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K. GARRISON (1946-1991)  
RANDOLPH E. PAUL (1946-1956)  
SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1995)  
LOUIS S. WEISS (1927-1950)  
JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)

UNIT 5201, FORTUNE FINANCIAL CENTER  
5 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU  
CHAOYANG DISTRICT, BEIJING 100020, CHINA  
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300

SUITES 3601 – 3606 & 3610  
36/F, GLOUCESTER TOWER  
THE LANDMARK  
15 QUEEN'S ROAD, CENTRAL  
HONG KONG  
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE  
10 NOBLE STREET  
LONDON EC2V 7JU, UNITED KINGDOM  
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600

535 MISSION STREET, 24TH FLOOR  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105  
TELEPHONE (628) 432-5100

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING  
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME  
CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN  
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE  
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100  
P.O. BOX 226  
TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3  
TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

2001 K STREET, NW  
WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047  
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200  
POST OFFICE BOX 32  
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032  
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

MATTHEW W. ABBOTT  
EDWARD T. ACKERMAN  
JACOB A. ADLERSTEIN  
ALLAN J. ARFFA  
JONATHAN H. ASHTOR  
ROBERT A. ATKINS  
KANESH BALASUBRAMANIAM\*  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PAUL M. BASTA  
LYNN B. BAYARD  
JOSEPH J. BIAL  
BRUCE BIRENBOIM  
H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING  
BRIAN BOLIN  
ANGELO BONVINO  
ANDRE G. BOUCHARD\*  
PAUL D. BRACHMAN  
GERALD BRANT  
ROBERT A. BRITTON  
WALTER F. BROWN\*  
SUSANNA M. BUERGEL  
JESSICA S. CAREY  
JOHN P. CARLIN  
DAVID CARMONA  
GEOFFREY R. CHEPIGA  
ELLEN N. CHING  
WILLIAM A. CLEMAN  
LEWIS R. CLAYTON  
YAHONNES CLEARY  
REBECCA S. COCCARO  
JAY COHEN  
KELLEY A. CORNISH  
CHRISTOPHER J. CUMMINGS  
TIHITINA DAGNEW  
THOMAS V. DE LA BASTIDE III  
MEREDITH R. DEARBORN\*  
KAREN L. DUNN  
ALICE BELISLE EATON  
ANDREW J. EHRLICH  
CAROLINE B. EPSTEIN  
GREGORY A. EZRING  
ROSS A. FIELDSTON  
ANDREW C. FINCH  
BRAD J. FINKELSTEIN  
BRIAN P. FINNEGAN  
ROBERTO FINZI  
PETER E. FISCH  
HARRIS FISCHMAN  
KATHERINE B. FORREST  
VICTORIA S. FORRESTER  
ANDRIS B. FRIEDUS  
MANUEL S. FREY  
KENNETH A. GALLO  
MICHAEL E. GERTZMAN  
ADDAM M. GIVERTZ  
SALVATORE GOGLIORMELLA  
NEIL GOLDMAN  
MATTHEW B. GOLDSTEIN  
ROBERTO J. GONZALEZ\*  
CHARLES H. GOOGE, JR.  
ANDREW G. GORDON  
BRIAN S. GRIEVE  
UDI GROFMAN  
MELINDA HAAG\*  
ALAN S. HALPERIN  
CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN  
IAN M. HAZLETT  
BRIAN S. HERMANN  
JOSHUA HILL JR.  
MICHELE HIRSHMAN  
JARRETT R. HOFFMAN  
ROBERT HOLO  
CHRISTOPHER HOPKINS  
DAVID S. HUNTINGTON  
AMRAN HUSSEIN  
LORETTA A. IPPOLITO  
WILLIAM A. ISAACSON\*  
JAREN JANGHORBANI  
BRIAN M. JANSON  
LUKE JENNINGS  
JEH C. JOHNSON  
ROGER JOHNSON\*  
DEIRDRE JONES  
MATTHEW B. JORDAN  
CHRISTODOULOS KAOUTZANIS  
BRAD S. KARP  
PATRICK N. KARSNITZ  
JOHN C. KENNEDY  
ROBERT A. KILLIP  
BRIAN KIM  
KYLE J. KIMPLER  
ROBERT A. KINDLER  
JEFFREY L. KOCHAN  
ALEXIA D. KORBERG

DANIEL J. KRAMER  
ANDREW D. KRAUSE  
BRIAN KRAUSE  
CAITH KUSHNER  
DAVID K. LAKHDHIR  
GREGORY F. LAUFER  
BRIAN C. LAVIN  
MATTHEW N. LEIST\*  
XIAOYU GREG LIU  
RANDY LUSKEY\*  
LORETTA E. LYNCH  
JEFFREY D. MARELL  
MARCO V. MASOTTI  
DAVID W. MAYO  
ELIZABETH R. MCCOLM  
JEAN M. MCLOUGHLIN  
MARK F. MENDELSON  
CLAUDINE MEREDITH-GOUJON  
WILLIAM B. MICHAEL  
SEAN A. MITCHELL  
ERIN J. MORGAN  
JUDIE NG SHORTELL\*  
CATHERINE NYARADY  
JANE B. O'BRIEN  
BRAD R. OKUN  
SUNG PAK  
CRYSTAL D. PARKER  
LINDSAY B. PARKS  
ANDREW M. PARLEN  
DANIELLE C. PENHALL  
CHARLES J. PESANT  
ANASTASIA V. PETERSON  
JESSICA E. PHILLIPS\*  
AUSTIN S. PHLET\*  
RAVI PUROHIT  
VALERIE E. RADWANER  
JEFFREY J. RECHER  
LORIN L. REISNER  
JEANNE S. RHE\*  
ANDREW N. ROSENBERG  
JACQUELINE P. RUBIN  
RAPHAEL M. RUSSO  
ELIZABETH M. SACKSTEDER  
JEFFREY B. SAMUELS  
PAUL L. SANDLER  
AARON J. SCHLAPHOFF  
KENNETH M. SCHNEIDER  
ROBERT B. SCHUMER  
JOHN M. SCOTT  
BRIAN SCRIVANI  
KYLE T. SEIFRIED  
KANNON K. SHANMUGAM  
SCOTT A. SHER\*  
SUHAN SHIM  
CULLEN L. SINCLAIR  
MAURY SLEVIN  
KYLE SMITH  
AUDRA J. SOLOWAY  
SCOTT M. SONTAG  
JOSHUA H. SOVEN\*  
MEGAN SPELMAN  
ROBERT Y. SPERLING  
EYITAYO ST. MATTHEW-DANIEL  
SARAH STASNY  
BEN STEADMAN  
AIDAN SYNNOTT  
ROBERT D. TANANBAUM  
BRETTE TANNENBAUM  
RICHARD C. TARLOWE  
DAVID TARR  
MONICA K. THURMOND  
DANIEL J. TOAL  
LAURA C. TURANO  
CONRAD VAN LOGGERENBERG  
KRISHNA VEERARAGHAVAN  
JEREMY M. VEIT  
LIZA M. VELAZQUEZ  
MICHAEL VOGEL  
ANDREA WAHLQUIST BROWN  
JOHN WEBER  
THEODORE V. WELLS, JR.  
SAMUEL J. WELT  
LINDSEY L. WIERSMA  
STEVEN J. WILLIAMS  
LAWRENCE I. WITDORCHIC  
MARK B. WLZLO  
STACI YABLON  
BOSCO YIU\*  
KAYE N. YOSHINO  
TONG YU  
TAURIE M. ZEITZER  
KENNETH S. ZIMAN  
T. ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI, JR.

\*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3311

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0311

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

rfinzi@paulweiss.com

October 5, 2023

### By ECF

The Honorable Sidney H. Stein  
U.S. District Judge, Southern District of New York  
United States Courthouse  
500 Pearl St.  
New York, NY 10007-1312

Re: *United States v. Menendez et al.*,  
1:23-cr-00490-SHS

Dear Judge Stein:

We write on behalf of all defendants in this case and in response to the government's letter to the Court sent yesterday afternoon regarding a proposed protective order. In particular, we write to respectfully propose two small but important modifications that the defendants raised with the government but that the government rejected after otherwise productive discussions. The first modification is consistent with language the government has agreed to in other cases. The second arises out of the *sui generis* nature of the allegations raised in the Indictment. In making these proposals, we note that separate arrangements will be required for classified material, which is beyond the scope of this order.

Our two proposals—reflected in the attached redline to the government’s proposed order, (Ex. A), and clean draft (Ex. B)—are as follows:

1. We ask that the language of Paragraph 11 be amended to include language (as shown in the attached redline, Ex. A) that makes explicit that, if there is a dispute as to the designation of a particular document that cannot be resolved by the parties, the government bears the burden of establishing “good cause” for the restrictions sought. This language is consistent with established law and with multiple protective orders sought by the government and entered by courts in this district. *See, e.g.*, Protective Order ¶ 7, *United States v. Vieser*, No. 22-cr-101-JMF (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 2, 2022), ECF No. 12 (“The Government shall bear the burden of establishing good cause for its designation of the disputed materials.”); Protective Order ¶ 9, *United States v. Marte*, No. 16-cr-740-GHW (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 25, 2021), ECF No. 274 (“The Government shall bear the burden of establishing good cause for its designation of the disputed materials as Confidential Material or Attorneys’ Eyes Only Material.”); Protective Order ¶ 10, *United States v. Delo*, No. 20-cr-500-JGK (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 18, 2021), ECF No. 41 (“The Government shall bear the burden of establishing good cause for its designation of the disputed materials as Confidential Material or Sensitive Disclosure Material.”); Protective Order ¶ 1(b), *United States v. Lopez*, No. 19-cr-323-JSR (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 26, 2019), ECF No. 52 (“The Government thereupon will have the burden of justifying the continuation of that designation.”).

As Judge Furman explained in denying the government’s application to expand a protective order in *United States v. Tokhtakhounov*, “[under] Rule 16(d)(1), the Government bears the burden of showing ‘good cause,’ which ‘is established on a showing that disclosure will work a clearly defined and serious injury to the party seeking closure. The injury must be shown with specificity. Broad allegations of harm, unsubstantiated by specific examples or articulated reasoning, do not support a good cause showing.” No. 13-cr-268-JMF, 2020 WL 1032880, at \*3 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 3, 2020) (quoting *United States v. Wecht*, 484 F.3d 194, 211(3d Cir. 2007)); *see also United States v. Ramirez*, No. 21-cr-41-AJN, 2021 WL 914457, at \*1 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 10, 2021) (“The party seeking to restrict disclosure bears the burden of showing good cause.” (citing *Gambale v. Deutsche Bank AG*, 377 F.3d 133, 142 (2d Cir. 2004))). Without the language requested by the defendants, the protective order proposed by the government would eliminate this requirement and improperly shift the burden to the defendants.

2. The government’s version of the protective order provides, at Paragraph 15, that the defense may not show any foreign person or entity any “Protected Material” without leave of the Court. As reflected in the attached redline, Ex. A, we request that this provision—which imposes a significantly higher burden on the defense in dealing with foreign individuals and/or entities—be amended to apply only to material designated as “Attorney’s Possession Only” or “Attorney’s Eyes Only.” We respectfully submit that—particularly in a case that includes allegations of conduct involving foreign actors on foreign soil—a provision covering all foreign nationals or entities should be narrowly tailored, and therefore propose that it be limited to documents that the government truly believes are sensitive. *See Ramirez*, 2021 WL 914457, at \*1 (The determination of whether the government has established good cause for the entry of a protective order “requires courts to balance several interests, including . . . whether the imposition of the protective order would prejudice the defendant”); *United States v. Smith*, 985 F. Supp. 2d

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

The Honorable Sidney H. Stein

3

506, 524 (S.D.N.Y. 2013) (“courts should take care to ensure that the protection afforded to [discovery] information is no broader than is necessary to accomplish the [proffered] goals” of the protective order (citing *United States v. Lindh*, 198 F. Supp. 2d 739, 741–42 (E.D. Va. 2002))).

Again, we note that nothing in these proposed changes affects classified information, which will be subject to a different regime under CIPA.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Roberto Finzi", with a stylized flourish above the name.

Roberto Finzi

Enclosures

cc: All Counsel (by ECF)